



Be it Resolved: A Lesson in Debating

A Lesson Plan for the *Exploration, the Fur Trade and Hudson's Bay Company Site*

In this lesson, students will research the effects of European-Aboriginal interaction to support one side of a debate. The information is available from the *Exploration, the Fur Trade and Hudson's Bay Company* site.

Subject/Ages

Subject: Social Studies (History), Ages 10 to 13

Overview

The first lesson may be used to introduce or review debating procedures and to begin research on the issues. Further class time for research may be given or assigned as homework. Students may work in teams of three to five or may be two individuals with opposing views.

Outcomes (WCP, APEF)

Expectations (ON)

Objectives (QC)

Social Studies Outcomes

By the end of these activities, students should be able to:

- Identify some of the consequences of Aboriginal and European interactions
- Analyze, classify, and interpret information

Language Arts Outcomes

(R) Reading:

- Read and respond to non-fiction materials

(W) Writing

- Use writing for various purposes and in a range of contexts, including school work (e.g. to record and organize ideas)

(O/V) Oral and Visual Communication

- Express and respond to a range of ideas and opinions concisely, clearly, and appropriately
- Contribute and work constructively in groups

These Language Arts Outcomes correspond to:

- WCP GO – R: 3.2; W: 3.2, O/V: 5.2, 5.1
- Quebec objectives – 2 (Reading); 1 (Writing); 2, 1 (Oral)
- APEF CGO – R: 4; W: 5; O/V: 1, 2.1

Materials/Resources Required

Computers with access to the Internet
Student Handout
Assessment Sheet

Links

Early Canadiana Online: *Exploration, the Fur Trade and Hudson's Bay Company*
URL: <http://www.canadiana.org/>

Hudson's Bay Company History Page

URL: http://www.hbc.com/hbc/e_hi/default.htm (English)

URL: http://www.hbc.com/hbc/f_hi/default.htm (français)

The National Library of Canada: *Pathfinders and Passageways*

URL: <http://www.nlc-bnc.ca/explorers>

The Virtual Museum of New France

URL: http://www.vmnf.civilization.ca/explor/explcd_e.html

Musée Virtuel de la Nouvelle-France

URL: http://www.vmnf.civilization.ca/explor/explor_f.html

Previous Knowledge

Students will need an understanding of Web navigation symbols, tools and terminology, particularly the tools used in *Exploration, the Fur Trade and Hudson's Bay Company* site.

Lesson Opener

Watch a videotape of debate or invite a debating club to present a debate. Spend some time reviewing the debate. What purpose does it serve? People have different points of views and reasons for them.

Procedure

Review the steps of a debate:

A debate is stated as an affirmative proposition and is generally is broken down as follows:

- First speaker: in favour of the resolution (7 minutes)
- Second speaker: in opposition to the resolution (7 minutes)
- Short break
- Third speaker: in favour of the resolution (7 minutes)
- Fourth speaker: in opposition to the resolution (7 minutes)
- Short break
- Fifth speaker: opposition rebuttal (5 minutes)
- Sixth speaker: affirmative rebuttal (5 minutes)

Students may also develop and use a rubric or other form of evaluation to study the process.

The issues to be debated may include the following:

Resolved: The Europeans had the right to claim land in North America for their home country.

Resolved: First nations and Inuit peoples benefited from the arrival of Europeans and the fur trade.

Resolved: European settlers and fur traders had the same effect on native peoples, although at different times.

Resolved: European settlers and fur traders could have succeeded without the First Nations and Inuit peoples being on the land.

Prepare for the debates:

- If it is the first class debate, spend adequate time preparing the students to use research, logic and inference rather than emotion to state their views.
- Groups should take notes from the *Exploration, the Fur Trade and Hudson's Bay Company* web site (and other sites, if they choose), organize their ideas, and prepare an argument for the debate.
- A speaker should be selected.

Managing the debates:

- During the debate, group members should take notes to be used in the next round.
- In the short breaks, the groups should come together again to prepare new arguments
- The educator, or students, can decide the winner
- Students may also develop and use a rubric or other form of evaluation to study the process.

Time limits may be adjusted according to the particular class. Emphasize to students that it does not matter which side of the debate they are on.

Summary

Discuss the debate format. How did the students respond? Which argument was most convincing? Why? Did they change their views over the course of the debate? How did they make up their minds as to which side was correct? Discuss the fact that many issues are only resolved by using a compromise between opposing views.

Evaluation

See the Assessment Sheet. Educators may also wish to use student-developed rubrics.

Homework/Extension

Students could use the notes from the debate to write a report, with their side of the resolution as a thesis statement. They could refute arguments from the opposing side to strengthen their own arguments.



Be it Resolved: A Lesson in Debating Student Handout

In this lesson, you will research the effects of European-Aboriginal interaction to support one side of a debate. The information is available from the *Exploration, the Fur Trade and Hudson's Bay Company* site.

A debate is an argument with rules, and is generally organized like this:

- First speaker: in favour of the resolution (7 minutes)
- Second speaker: in opposition to the resolution (7 minutes)
- Short break
- Third speaker: in favour of the resolution (7 minutes)
- Fourth speaker: in opposition to the resolution (7 minutes)
- Short break
- Fifth speaker: opposition rebuttal (5 minutes)
- Sixth speaker: affirmative rebuttal (5 minutes)

The debate will usually start with a positive statement, like these:

Resolved: The Europeans had the right to claim land in North America for their home country.

Resolved: First nations and Inuit peoples benefited from the arrival of Europeans and the fur trade.

Resolved: European settlers and fur traders had the same effect on native peoples, although at different times.

Resolved: European settlers and fur traders could have succeeded without the First Nations and Inuit peoples being on the land.

Prepare for your debate!

- Use research and logic rather than emotion.
- Take notes from the *Exploration, the Fur Trade and Hudson's Bay Company* web site (and other sites, if you choose)
- Organize your ideas, and prepare an argument for the debate.
- Choose a speaker (or speakers, if you are taking turns).

During the debate:

- Take notes to be used in the next round.
- In the short breaks, come together as a group to prepare new arguments.

Possible Sources

Early Canadiana Online: *Exploration, the Fur Trade and Hudson's Bay Company*

URL: <http://www.canadiana.org/>

Hudson's Bay Company History Page

URL: http://www.hbc.com/hbc/e_hi/default.htm (English)

URL: http://www.hbc.com/hbcf/f_hi/default.htm (français)

The National Library of Canada: *Pathfinders and Passageways*

URL: <http://www.nlc-bnc.ca/explorers>

The Virtual Museum of New France

URL: http://www.vmnf.civilization.ca/explor/explcd_e.html

Musée Virtuel de la Nouvelle-France

URL: http://www.vmnf.civilization.ca/explor/explor_f.html



Be it Resolved: A Lesson in Debating Assessment Criteria

Program Area: Social Studies (History)

Criterion: Understanding Concepts

Attainment Descriptors:

- Prepared information for debate accurately reflects the information as outlined in the *Exploration, the Fur Trade and Hudson's Bay Company* Web site
- Personal opinions and arguments expressed in the debate are supported by clearly communicated evidence from the *Exploration, the Fur Trade and Hudson's Bay Company* Web site

Program Area: Language, Reading

Criterion: Reading of Non-fiction Materials

Attainment Descriptor:

- Reads related information from NLC-BNC Web site as specified by the teacher
- Applies information from reading to the debate

Program Area: Language, Writing

Criterion: Use writing for various purposes and in a range of contexts

Attainment Descriptor:

- Uses note-taking effectively to record and organize information and ideas for the debate

Program Area: Oral and Visual Communication

Criterion: Conventions

Attainment Descriptor:

- Speaks clearly and uses appropriate variety in volume, rate, tone and pitch, pause, stress and emphasis, inflection, fluency.
- Follows format of debate properly (uses time appropriately, does not interrupt, refutes arguments in rebuttal)

Program Area: Language, Oral and Visual Communication

Criterion: Cooperative Group Work

Attainment Descriptor:

- Listens attentively to organize and classify information and to clarify thinking